

**ITEM III-B: SIGN VARIANCE & PLANNED SIGN PERMIT PROGRAM MODIFICATION – HRNSP PARCELS 42A & B (ROSEVILLE CROSSING SHOPPING CENTER) 10551 FAIRWAY DRIVE – FILE # 2006PL-091 (V-000028 & PSP-000063)**

**REQUEST**

The applicant requests approval of a Sign Variance and Planned Sign Permit Program Modification (PSP) to revise the existing comprehensive sign program for the Roseville Crossing Shopping Center. The proposed Variance and PSP requests a third monument sign, 25 feet in height, with an area of 275 square feet. The request also includes wall signage of up to 300 square feet in area, where the Sign Ordinance permits 200 square feet per building.

Applicant/Owner: Sywest Development, Robert Atkinson and Mikel Dreiling

**SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION**

The Planning & Redevelopment Department recommends that the Design Committee:

- A. Adopt the three (3) findings of fact for the Sign Variance;
- B. Approve the Sign Variance with three (3) condition of approval;
- C. Adopt the three (3) findings of fact for the Planned Sign Permit Program; and
- D. Approve the Planned Sign Permit Program with three (3) conditions of approval.

**SUMMARY OF OUTSTANDING ISSUES**

**Monument Signs:** The applicant is requesting a third freestanding monument sign that would exceed Sign Ordinance criteria of permitted number, height and area of freestanding monument signs.

Staff does not believe the required findings can be made in order to approve the request for a third sign, and recommends the site remain limited to two monument signs. The two (2) permitted monument signs can be placed on Fairway Drive as shown in the existing PSP, or the PSP can be modified to include one monument sign on Fairway Drive, and the second sign at the proposed location at the rear of the site.

If the PSP is modified to include a monument sign visible from Highway 65, staff recommends inclusion of Condition No. 2 to allow the sign to exceed the Sign Ordinance 15-foot height criteria and be a maximum of 20-feet. The monument sign area would be required to comply with the Sign Ordinance monument sign area, location and design criteria (i.e., 150 sq. ft. maximum, inclusive of base and embellishments).

**Wall Signs:** The Sign Ordinance and the approved PSP indicate the maximum area of all wall signs is 200 square feet per tenant. The applicant requests approval of the Variance and the PSP modification to permit the wall sign areas to exceed the Sign Ordinance criteria, ranging between 225 to 300 square feet per tenant.

As explained in the Evaluation section, staff believes the required findings can be made to support the request to increase the wall sign area to 300 sq. ft. for the two, 4-story hotel buildings. However, staff does not believe the findings can be made to support the Variance request to increase the wall sign area of the

smaller tenant spaces and buildings within the center, as approval of the request would grant a special privilege not enjoyed by other similar properties.

The applicant is not in agreement with staff's recommendations and wishes to proceed with the Variance request as submitted.

## **BACKGROUND**

**Location:** The project is located on approximately 18 acres bounded by Blue Oaks Boulevard and the jurisdictional boundary shared with the City of Rocklin on the north, Fairway Drive on the east, the Blue Oaks off-ramp from Highway 65 and preserved open space on the west, and the Target Greatland shopping center on the south. The site is within the Highland Reserve North Specific Plan area, Parcels 42 A and B (Attachment 1).

**Entitlements:** The Planning Commission approved a Design Review Permit and Tentative Subdivision Map for the site on February 23, 2006 (file #sDRP-000072 & SUB-000038). On February 9, 2007 the Planning Commission approved a Design Review Permit Modification (file # 2006PL-209, DRP-000157 & SUB-000085) to permit construction of five (5) commercial retail buildings totaling 37,600 square feet, and two (2) four-story hotels providing a total of 242 rooms (133,000 square feet), in place of the previously approved five (5) commercial retail buildings totaling 123,500 square feet.

On April 10, 2007 a Planned Sign Permit Program (PSP) for the Roseville Crossing center was approved administratively that is consistent with the Sign Ordinance. The PSP established sign criteria that specified wall sign criteria, and the location, design and area of two project monument signs (file # PSP-000047, Attachment 2).

At this time the applicant is requesting a Variance and modification of the approved Planned Sign Permit Program to permit a third monument sign that exceeds the Sign Ordinance permitted number, height and area criteria for monument signs. The Variance and PSP modification also request approval to exceed the maximum permitted wall sign area of 200 square feet (Exhibit A).

**City of Rocklin:** While not directly related to this request, it is worth noting that the applicant is also in discussions with the City of Rocklin to secure authorization to install a monument sign adjacent to Blue Oaks Boulevard on the strip of property within Rocklin's jurisdiction. Approximately half of the strip of land is within private ownership; the other half is City of Rocklin controlled right-of-way for Blue Oaks Boulevard. If approved, the sign could potentially match the sign on the opposite side of Blue Oaks Boulevard that pursuant to the City of Rocklin Sign Ordinance, is permitted to be 30-feet in height. The applicant does not at this time have control of the property, and has not submitted a sign permit application to the City of Rocklin. Should the applicant eventually secure approvals for this sign, the center would have three (3) monument signs. Should the Variance be approved as requested by the applicant, the center would have four (4) monument signs.

## **EVALUATION**

The signs described in this PSP have been evaluated using the standards for building complexes contained in the City of Roseville Sign Ordinance (Section 17.06.220 and 230). The proposed PSP would modify the guidelines for freestanding signs and wall signs for the center that was approved earlier this year administratively. However, the proposed PSP provisions deviate from the Sign Ordinance criteria for the number, height and area of freestanding signs, and criteria for the area of wall signs. As such, a Sign Variance is required. The Variance evaluation discusses the number of wall signs and monument signs in excess of the Sign Ordinance requirements. Evaluation of the Sign Variance is discussed first, since it is necessary to approve the Sign Variance in order to approve the PSP modification.

## **VARIANCE**

In accordance with the provisions of the Sign Ordinance, three (3) specific findings must be made in order to approve a Sign Variance. The required findings for a Sign Variance are listed below and are followed by an evaluation.

1. *There are exceptional or extraordinary circumstances or conditions applying to the land, building or signs involved which do not generally apply to other land, buildings or signs in the neighborhood.*
2. *The granting of this variance is necessary for the preservation and enjoyment of substantial property rights of the applicant.*
3. *The granting of this variance will not materially and adversely affect the health, safety or welfare of persons in the neighborhood, nor be materially detrimental or injurious to property or improvements in the neighborhood.*

### **Free Standing Monument Signs**

The requested Variance is to allow a third, freeway-visible, freestanding monument sign at the rear of the project site. As previously noted, the third monument sign is proposed at 25-feet tall, and 275 square feet in area (Exhibit A, page 6).

**Quantity:** Section 17.06.220 of the Sign Ordinance allows one (1) on-site freestanding sign per street with a primary entrance to the complex if the project frontage exceeds one thousand lineal feet (1,000 ft.). If the project frontage exceeds two thousand (2,000) lineal feet, one (1) additional on-site freestanding sign is permitted for every one thousand (1,000) lineal feet of frontage, or portion thereof, in excess of two thousand (2,000) lineal feet. The retail center has approximately 2,150 feet of frontage; therefore, the project is entitled two (2) monument signs.

Justification for the Variance request to allow a third monument sign is provided by the applicant (Attachment 3). In summary, the applicant believes a third sign is warranted due to:

- With its location adjacent to Highway 65 the sign will identify the site as a prominent shopping center located within the City of Roseville;
- The sign will help attract shoppers traveling on Highway 65 to shop in Roseville; and
- The sign will provide Roseville Crossing retailers with signage comparable to other centers, both in the cities of Roseville and Rocklin.

As noted above, the center is permitted two (2) monument signs, which is consistent with similarly sized projects along Fairway Drive and elsewhere, and will provide adequate center identification. Access to the Roseville Crossing retail center is provided from Fairway Drive via two new driveways to be constructed, and a third, existing driveway that will be shared with the adjacent Target Greatland store. One of the new driveways will be at the signalized intersection of Cortina Circle. The existing PSP indicates the two (2) permitted monument signs will be installed on Fairway Drive; one sign at the signalized intersection and the second sign at the driveway closest to the intersection of Blue Oaks Boulevard and Fairway Drive.

In addition, the applicant has requested approval of a Variance to allow additional wall sign area (225 sq. ft. to 300 sq. ft.); staff believes it is warranted for the two 4-story hotel buildings to be permitted a maximum of 300 sq. ft. (see discussion of Wall Signs below). The site will be visible from two streets

and Highway 65, and the two 4-story hotels will make the retail center easily identifiable. Staff is not aware of any applicable highway safety standards for on-site, commercial signs.

Based on the site's location, visibility and the tall hotel buildings that may have additional wall sign area, there are no circumstances that would place this center at a disadvantage from other centers. Staff believes that granting an additional monument sign would provide a competitive advantage to this center over similar centers in the City of Roseville. Staff has not identified any public safety or additional site identification needs that would warrant approval of this request. Therefore, staff recommends that the Design Committee deny the request for the additional monument sign.

The current PSP indicates the monument signs will be installed on Fairway Drive, at the two (2) new driveway locations. The Sign Ordinance restricts quantity, but not the location of monument signs. As such, options available to the applicant include locating the two (2) monument signs either both on Fairway Drive as shown in the existing PSP, or locating one sign at the signalized intersection of Fairway Drive and Cortina Circle, and the 2nd sign at the rear of the site as proposed (but with height, design and area limitations consistent with the Sign Ordinance).

The applicant is not in agreement with staff's evaluation and requests approval of the Planned Sign Program (Exhibit A) as proposed to allow the Roseville Crossing shopping center a third freestanding monument sign.

**Height and Area:** The Sign Ordinance restricts monument signs to a maximum height of fifteen feet (15 ft.). The Sign Ordinance also stipulates that the maximum area of each sign excluding the base and/or embellishments shall be 100 square feet; the maximum area of each sign, including the base and/or embellishments, shall be 150 square feet.

As previously noted, the Variance request is for a 25-foot tall sign, with an area of 275 square feet inclusive of base and embellishments. The applicant has indicated the increased sign size is necessary to provide signage consistent with neighboring shopping centers, and it meets highway safety standards (Attachment 3).

The Roseville Crossing shopping center is allowed signage that is consistent with similar centers through uniform and successful application of the Sign Ordinance criteria to similar retail centers throughout the City of Roseville. Staff does not support the argument that a larger sign is necessary to meet highway safety standards, and is concerned that approval of a Variance based on this argument would set a precedent for future requests. It is staff's opinion that if a larger sign is necessary for safety, then the preferred option is to not have a sign in this location. However, consistent with the criteria for approval of a Variance, the site does have unique conditions that make it possible to support an increased sign height at this location.

Staff has reviewed the grading plan (see Attachment 4) and visited the site, and found the site is elevated approximately ten to twenty feet (10 - 20 ft.) above Highway 65 (Attachment 5). The hotels and retail buildings will be highly visible to vehicles on the Highway, similar to other sites along the Highway 65 corridor that are likewise elevated above the Highway.

However, the site does have additional setback from Highway 65 that is unique to this site as compared to other centers along the Highway 65 corridor. The site is setback from Highway 65 due to the off ramp and the Open Space parcel located between the ramp and the rear property line (Attachment 6). While there are some project sites along the Highway 65 corridor that are also setback from the Highway due to being adjacent to a ramp, the subject site is setback an additional 100 to 400 feet beyond the off ramp due to the Open Space parcel.

The additional setback unique to this site will make the text of a monument sign more difficult to read. Because of the unique site condition of additional setback, if a monument sign is located at the rear of the property, staff recommends inclusion of **Condition 2** to permit an increase in the maximum height of the rear monument sign to 20-feet.

A recent comparison is the Shea Center monument sign, which was previously permitted a 20-foot sign. The sign was also permitted to exceed the 150 square foot area limitation; however, there were embellishments that coordinated with the center and the monument sign. Absent similar artistic features, it is reasonable to assume that a 20-foot sign for the Roseville Crossing center would be able to meet the 150-foot square foot area criteria. **Condition 2** clarifies that while a sign located at the rear of the site is permitted to be a maximum 20-feet in height, it is required to comply with the Sign Ordinance area, and location and design requirements (i.e., a maximum of 100-square feet in area, excluding base and embellishments, and a maximum of 150-square feet in area including the base and embellishments).

The applicant is not in agreement with inclusion of Condition 2, and requests approval of the Planned Sign Program (Exhibit A) as proposed for the 25-foot tall sign at 275 square feet.

### **Tenant Wall Signs**

The Sign Ordinance states the combined area for wall signs shall not exceed twenty percent (20%) of the front tenant space façade, up to a maximum of 200 square feet. In addition, the lengths of wall signs are not permitted to exceed seventy percent (70%) of the length of the tenant space façade or building façade, and are not permitted to exceed two-thirds of the height of the area to which the sign is attached.

The Variance request includes increasing the wall sign area as follows:

- Maximum wall sign area of 225 sq. ft. for tenant spaces of 4,000 to 14,999 sq. ft.;
- Maximum wall sign area of 250 sq. ft. for tenant spaces of 15,000 to 39,999 sq. ft.; and
- Maximum wall sign area of 300 sq. ft. for Major tenants, over 40,000 sq. ft. (the two hotel buildings).

Wall sign area Variances have previously been approved for single-user buildings visible from Highway 65 or Interstate 80, and with larger floor plates. The floor plate sizes and wall sign areas of previously approved Variances have ranged from 240 square feet for Toys R Us (floor plate size 45,000 square feet) to 378 square feet for Wal-Mart Phase II (floor plate size 226,926 square feet).

The buildings that will be visible from Highway 65 are indicated in the complete list of buildings and their sizes (Attachment 7). The in-line tenant and pad buildings are single-story buildings, ranging in size from 4,000 to 18,000 square feet. While some of the retail buildings will be visible from Highway 65, they are not of unusual size. Additional sign area for these buildings is not necessary to provide them wall signage equitable with similar centers along the Highway 65 corridor.

The applicant may wish to revise the PSP to clarify that all the non-major tenant buildings are pad buildings; as such each tenant would be allowed a minimum of two signs, and up to 200 square feet. The signs would remain subject to the criteria provided in the Sign Ordinance and the current PSP that ensure the signs are proportional to the tenant space (i.e., not exceed two-thirds the height of the area to which the sign is attached).

Application of the Sign Ordinance criteria in the above manner has proved successful in similar centers; the applicant has not provided drawings or indicated why the criteria can not be met in this center, other than to indicate it is necessary to provide their tenants adequate sign area (Attachment 3).

The Major Tenants are the two (2) hotel buildings that are 63,000 and 70,000 square feet (Buildings 9 and 10, respectively). The hotels will both be 4-stories and will be visible from Highway 65.

Staff recommends approval of the increase in wall sign area from 200 to 300 square feet for the two, four-story hotel buildings. This proposed criterion would be consistent with the signage criteria being proposed in the draft Sign Ordinance for large floor plate users adjacent to freeways and the Corporate Center criteria, which will permit a maximum of 300 square feet of wall sign area for buildings with four floors. **Condition 3** is recommended for inclusion to permit the 4-story hotel wall sign area to be a maximum 300 square feet, and to clarify that all wall signs must comply with all other Sign Ordinance requirements with respect to size, length, and height.

### **PLANNED SIGN PERMIT PROGRAM**

The subject site is defined as a building complex in the Sign Ordinance and is required to receive approval of a Planned Sign Permit Program (PSP) before the installation of any signs within the complex. The proposed PSP for the Roseville Crossing Shopping Center would modify the existing PSP and would revise guidelines for the installation of wall signs and freestanding signs within the center. The signs described in this sign program have been evaluated using the standards for building complexes contained in the City of Roseville Sign Ordinance.

As noted above, the proposed PSP modification is to incorporate the items evaluated in the Variance discussion. In accordance with the provisions of the Sign Ordinance, three (3) specific findings must be made in order to approve the Planned Sign Permit Program. The required findings for a Planned Sign Permit Program are listed below and are followed by a brief evaluation.

1. *The proposed PSP is consistent with the provisions and intent of the Roseville Sign Ordinance.*

In conjunction with the Planned Sign Permit Program modification, the applicant is requesting a Sign Variance to allow an additional freestanding monument sign, with height and area in excess of the Sign Ordinance criteria. The request also includes maximum wall sign areas in excess of the Sign Ordinance criteria.

If the Variance request is approved and the PSP modified consistent with the Variance Conditions of Approval, the modified PSP will be consistent with the Sign Ordinance. The remainder of the PSP was previously found to be consistent with the Sign Ordinance when the existing PSP was administratively approved earlier this year.

2. *The proposed PSP is in harmony with, and visually related to, the buildings within the Planned Sign Permit Program and the surrounding development.*

The Sign Criteria requires a consistent sign appearance throughout the center. The proposed signs are designed to be compatible with the buildings and will provide continuity throughout the center through use of design, colors and appropriate scale. Staff supports the request as proposed.

3. *The proposed PSP is consistent with the adopted Highland Reserve North Specific Plan, Landscape Design Guidelines or other applicable regulations in which it is located, as applicable.*

The Highland Reserve North Specific Plan, Landscape Design Guidelines include guidelines for optional entry signage. Given the applicant does not have control of the corner at the intersection of Blue Oaks Boulevard and Fairway Drive installation of the suggested corner clip and entry monument sign is not presently feasible. No other guidelines are applicable to this site.

## **CONCLUSION**

As noted above, the findings can be made for the approval of the Planned Sign Permit Program with the approval of the Sign Variance as conditioned.

Staff has been unable to identify any unique circumstances, public safety concerns or demonstrated hardship applicable to the Roseville Crossing Shopping Center that would justify three project monument signs. The standard regulating monument signs has been uniformly and successfully applied to similar retail centers throughout the City. Approval of the third monument sign where a clear hardship has not been demonstrated would grant a right not enjoyed by other property owners.

If the applicant chooses to place one of the two permitted monument signs at the rear of the site, given the unique additional setback of the site from Highway 65 it would be reasonable to permit the sign height be a maximum of 20-feet in height, exceeding the Sign Ordinance criteria by five feet. The sign would remain subject to all other monument sign area, location and design criteria.

Staff further believes the request lacks adequate justification for increasing the maximum allowed wall sign area for non-major tenants. The applicant has not demonstrated a need to increase the maximum area, which has worked effectively at other centers. However, somewhat unique to the retail center is inclusion of two 4-story hotels. Approval of the Variance to allow a maximum of 300 square feet of wall sign area for the two hotels would be consistent with the signage criteria being proposed for large floor plate users adjacent to freeways and the Corporate Center criteria.

Therefore, staff recommends approval of a Sign Variance and Planned Sign Permit Program as conditioned below to:

- Not permit a 3<sup>rd</sup> monument sign;
- Allow a 2<sup>nd</sup> monument sign at the rear of the site, with a maximum height of 20-feet;
- Allow the wall sign areas for the two 4-story hotels (Buildings 9 and 10, 10569 and 10593 Fairway Drive) be a maximum 300 square feet, exceeding the 200 square foot Sign Ordinance maximum.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION**

The project is categorically exempt pursuant to Section 15311(a) of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines pertaining to on-premise signs.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

The Planning & Redevelopment Department recommends that the Design Committee take the following actions:

- A. Adopt the three findings of fact, as stated in the staff report, for approval of the SIGN VARIANCE - HRNSP PARCELS 42A & B CENTER – ROSEVILLE CROSSING SHOPPING CENTER – 10551 FAIRWAY DRIVE - FILE # V-000028;

- B. Approve the SIGN VARIANCE - HRNSP PARCELS 42A & B CENTER – ROSEVILLE CROSSING SHOPPING CENTER – 10551 FAIRWAY DRIVE - FILE # V-000028 with the following three (3) Conditions of Approval;
- C. Adopt the three (3) findings of fact, as stated in the staff report, for the PLANNED SIGN PERMIT PROGRAM – HRNSP PARCELS 42A & B CENTER – ROSEVILLE CROSSING SHOPPING CENTER – 10551 FAIRWAY DRIVE - FILE # PSP-000063; and
- D. Approve the PLANNED SIGN PERMIT PROGRAM – HRNSP PARCELS 42A & B ROSEVILLE CROSSING SHOPPING CENTER – 10551 FAIRWAY DRIVE - FILE # PSP-000063 with the following three (3) Conditions of Approval.

**CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL FOR FILE# V-000028:**

- 1. The Roseville Crossing Shopping Center (10551 Fairway Drive, HRNSP Parcel 42 A and B) shall be limited to two freestanding monument signs. The signs shall be placed either two (2) on Fairway Drive, or one at the driveway at the intersection of Cortina Circle and Fairway Drive and one at the rear of the site visible to Highway 65. Locations shall be shown in the Final PSP to the satisfaction of the Planning and Redevelopment Department prior to issuance of any sign permits. (Planning & Redevelopment, Building)
- 2. Freestanding monument signs on Fairway Drive are subject to the Sign Ordinance height limitation and shall be a maximum height of fifteen feet (15 ft.). If a freestanding sign is located at the rear of the site, it shall be a maximum height of twenty feet (20 ft.). The monument signs shall comply with all other Sign Ordinance requirements with respect to area, and location and design. (Planning & Redevelopment, Building)
- 3. The two 4-story hotel buildings (10569 and 10593 Fairway Drive, Buildings 9 and 10) shall have a maximum wall sign area of 300 square feet, each. (Planning & Redevelopment, Building)

**CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL FOR FILE# PSP-000063:**

- 1. The PSP is approved as shown in Exhibit A and as conditioned or modified below. (Planning & Redevelopment)
- 2. A revised Sign Program and Guidelines for Roseville Crossing Shopping Center shall be submitted to the Planning & Redevelopment Department for review and approval prior to issuance of any Sign Permit. The PSP shall be modified consistent with the Variance Conditions of Approval (V-000028) to the satisfaction of the Planning & Redevelopment staff. (Planning & Redevelopment, Building)
- 3. A Sign Permit and Building Permit are required prior to installation of any sign. (Planning & Redevelopment, Building)

**ATTACHMENTS**

- 1. Vicinity Map
- 2. Existing Roseville Crossing retail center Planned Sign Program
- 3. Applicant's justification letter

4. Grading Plan
5. Site Photos taken from Highway 65
6. Aerial Photo of the Site
7. Building Square Feet

**EXHIBIT**

- A. Proposed Roseville Crossing Sign Program & Guidelines (Planned Sign Permit Program)

**Note to Applicant and/or Developer:** Please contact the Planning & Redevelopment Department staff at (916) 774-5276 prior to the Committee meeting if you have any questions on any of the recommended conditions for your project. If you challenge the decision of the Committee in court, you may be limited to raising only those issues which you or someone else raised at the public hearing held for this project, or in written correspondence delivered to the Planning & Redevelopment Director at, or prior to, the public hearing.